

City Council

Monday 11 October 2010

PRESENT:

Lord Mayor, Councillor Mrs Aspinall, Chair.
Deputy Lord Mayor, Councillor Coker, Vice Chair.
Councillors Ball, Mrs Beer, Berrow, Bowie, Bowyer, Mrs Bowyer, Mrs Bragg, Brookshaw, Browne, Dann, Mrs Dolan, Drean, Evans, K Foster, Mrs Foster, Fox, Fry, Gordon, James, Jordan, Martin Leaves, Michael Leaves, Sam Leaves, Lock, Lowry, Dr. Mahony, McDonald, Monahan, Murphy, Mrs Nelder, Nicholson, Mrs Nicholson, Mrs Pengelly, Rennie, Reynolds, Ricketts, Roberts, Dr. Salter, Smith, Stark, Mrs Stephens, Stevens, Thompson, Tuohy, Vincent, Viney, Mrs Watkins, Wheeler, Wogens, Wildy, Williams and Wright.

Also in attendance: Barry Keel (Chief Executive) and Tim Howes (Assistant Director for Democracy and Governance).

Apologies for absence: Councillors Delbridge, Haydon and King

The meeting started at 2.00 pm and finished at 7.40 pm.

Note: At a future meeting, the Council will consider the accuracy of these draft minutes, so they may be subject to change. Please check the minutes of that meeting to confirm whether these minutes have been amended.

41. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

In accordance with the Code of Conduct, the following declarations of interest were made in relation to items at this meeting –

Name	Item	Interest	Reason
Councillor Bowyer	Minute 55: Motion on Notice 10 - Cuts to Bus Routes in Plymouth	Personal and prejudicial	Joint shareholder of taxibank
Councillor Mrs Bowyer	Minute 55: Motion on Notice 10 - Cuts to Bus Routes in Plymouth	Personal and prejudicial	Joint shareholder of taxibank
Councillor Bragg	Minute 53: Motion on Notice 8 – Devonport Dockyard	Personal and prejudicial	Husband is employed at Devonport Dockyard
Councillor Dann	Minute 53: Motion on Notice 8 – Devonport Dockyard	Personal and prejudicial	Husband is employed at Devonport Dockyard
Councillor Martin Leaves	Minute 55: Motion on Notice 10 - Cuts to Bus Routes in Plymouth	Personal and prejudicial	Hackney Carriage and Private Hire licence holder

Councillor Michael Leaves	Minute 55: Motion on Notice 10 - Cuts to Bus Routes in Plymouth	Personal and prejudicial	Son is a Hackney Carriage and Private Hire licence holder
Councillor Sam Leaves	Minute 55: Motion on Notice 10 - Cuts to Bus Routes in Plymouth	Personal and prejudicial	Husband is a Hackney Carriage and Private Hire licence holder
Councillor Lowry	Minute 53: Motion on Notice 8 – Devonport Dockyard	Personal and prejudicial	Employee at Devonport Dockyard
Councillor Nicholson	Minute 53: Motion on Notice 8 – Devonport Dockyard	Personal and prejudicial	Employee of Babcock
Councillor Smith	Minute 53: Motion on Notice 8 – Devonport Dockyard	Personal and prejudicial	Employee at Devonport Dockyard
Councillor Vincent	Minute 55: Motion on Notice 10 - Cuts to Bus Routes in Plymouth	Personal and prejudicial	Employee of Plymouth Citybus

42. **TIMING SYSTEM**

The Lord Mayor reassured councillors that the timing system had been checked and no fault had been found.

43. **MINUTES**

The minutes of the special meeting of the Council held on 2 August 2010 were signed as a correct record. The minutes of the ordinary meeting of the Council on 2 August 2010 were signed as a correct record, subject to the amendment of minute 39 of the ordinary meeting on Page 11 of the agenda papers, to reflect that question 8 was from Councillor James to Councillor Wildy.

ANNOUNCEMENTS

44. **The Chief Executive**

Agreed that appointments to committees and outside bodies are determined as indicated below -

	Organisation	No. of Members	Term of Office	Appointments / Nominations
1	Academy – All Saints	One governor	Four years or until such time as the member resigns or is replaced by Council	Councillor Stark

2	Academy – Marine Academy Plymouth	Two governors Cllr Mrs Bragg and one vacancy	Four years or until such time as the member resigns or is replaced by Council	Principal Advisor Achievement 0-19 (John Searson)
3	Children and Young People's Trust Board	2 councillors and Cabinet Member	Continuing membership until such time as the member resigns or is replaced by Council	Councillor Evans to replace Councillor Dann
4	Devon Investment and Pension Fund Committee	two councillors (Cllrs Bowyer and Smith) and two substitutes (Cllr Dr Mahony and one vacancy)	Continuing membership until such time as the member resigns or is replaced by Council	Councillor Stark to replace Councillor Smith Substitute member: Councillor Thompson
5	Devon and Severn Inshore Fisheries and Conservation Authority – Shadow Authority	One councillor	Continuing membership until such time as the member resigns or is replaced by Council	Councillor Delbridge
6	Neighbourhood Board for Devonport (new appointments)	two councillors (one to be Devonport Ward representative)	Continuing membership until such time as the member resigns or is replaced by Council	Councillor Wildy (ward rep) One vacancy deferred to the next meeting.
7	Olford Bequest	two representatives	Fixed term of office for five years	Councillor Wildy Councillor Mrs Dolan
8	Plymouth Charity Trust	four representatives: Resignation of Councillor Lock	Fixed term of office for four years	One vacancy deferred to the next meeting

(9) the proposal for no appointment to be made to the Plymouth Foyer, in future, was deferred pending the submission of further information;

(10) the resignation of Councillors Brookshaw and Jordan from the Management Board of the Theatre Royal (Plymouth) Limited was noted; (No further appointments

would be made). The Lord Mayor advised councillors that any queries on this should be pursued outside of the meeting.

(11) the following changes of Committee membership have been notified to the Monitoring Officer and were noted -

	Committee	Change of Membership
(12)	Overview and Scrutiny Management Board	Councillor McDonald to replace Councillor Williams
(13)	Customer and Communities Overview and Scrutiny Panel	Councillor Coker to replace Councillor McDonald (and nominated Vice Chair, subject to approval by the Panel)
(14)	Health and Adult Social Care Overview and Scrutiny Panel	Councillor McDonald to replace Councillor Coker (and nominated Vice Chair, subject to approval by the Panel)
(15)	Licensing Sub Committee Miscellaneous	Councillor Williams to fill vacancy

45. **The Leader and Cabinet Members**

National Citizen Advice Bureau's Council Partner of the Year Award

The Leader reported that the City Council was 'voted highly commended by the judges' at the National Citizen Advice Bureau's Council Partner of the Year Award and the award was presented to Jo Hambly, on behalf of the Financial and Social Inclusion Team, at their Annual General Meeting. The Leader congratulated all those involved.

Building for Life

Councillor Fry advised councillors that twenty housing developments nationally had been awarded the highest industry standard for quality and design in new homes and five of these were in Plymouth. They were:

- Cargo, English Cities Fund with Ferguson Mann Architects (134 units)
- Astor Court, Cedar Homes Limited with the Architects Design Group (24 homes)
- Friars Lane, Pemberley Developments with Rogers and Haynes architects (15 homes)
- Graineys' Joinery, McAleer and Rusher Ltd with architects Lacie, Hickie Caley. (64 homes)
- Mills Bakery, Urban Splash with Gillespie Yunnie architects (78 homes)

The initiative was led by CABE (Commission for Architecture and the Built Environment) and the Home Builders Federation and awards were given to new housing schemes that demonstrate a commitment to high design standards and good place making. The awards were judged by a panel of experts each year.

Other Silver standard winners for 2010 were:

- Evolution Cove, developers Standerton House with the Architects Design Group with 58 homes
- James Place, University of Plymouth with Willmore Illes Architects Ltd (329 homes)
- Middleton's, Stevenson Homes Ltd with Roger and Haynes Architects (11 homes)
- Plymstock Library, Signpost Housing with Rogers and Haynes Architects (27 homes)

Matthew Coombe, Urban Planning Co-ordinator was thanked for his work and asked to take back to his colleagues, the Council's congratulations for their contribution to this tremendous achievement.

Customer Services Excellence Award for Library Services

Councillor Brookshaw reported that the library services had been awarded the Customer Services Excellence Award from G4S Assessment Services on behalf of the Cabinet Office.

Alistair MacNaughton (City Librarian) and the library services team were thanked for all their hard work.

Council of the Year Award for Customer Services

Councillor Jordan reported that the customer services team has been awarded the Council of the Year Award 2010 from Govmetric, a company that specialised in gathering customer feedback.

Katie Harris, representing the Customer Services team, was congratulated on this achievement.

South West in Bloom

Councillor Michael Leaves referred to Plymouth's achievements in the Royal Horticultural Society South West in Bloom competition.

Plymouth won gold in the large city category; Jude Miller (aged 7) won the School Painting Competition and Plymouth won the South West in Bloom Discretionary award Best Portfolio.

Plymouth also achieved the most neighbourhood awards – 24 in total.

There were five categories in the RHS 'It's your neighbourhood' award and Plymouth came away with four 'outstanding' - the top award given.

These awards recognised the work of local people improving their environments. The Community projects to receive an 'outstanding' were Diggin' It and the East End Community Allotment project. Two other outstanding awards were given to a communal garden at Shaftesbury Cottages in North Hill and Chichester Flats on West Hoe. Altogether Plymouth projects won seven thriving awards, five developing, seven improving and one in the establishing category.

Among the community projects winners in the regional competition were the Freedom Fields Youth Project, Jigsaw Garden, East End Community Allotment, Diggin It and Moor View.

The Parks Team was congratulated on their contribution towards this achievement.

46. **QUESTIONS BY THE PUBLIC**

There were no questions from the public for this meeting.

47. **LOCAL DEMOCRACY WEEK 2010: PRESENTATION BY THE UK YOUTH PARLIAMENT**

Kate Taylor and Marcus Natale (members of the youth parliament) and Reace McDonnell (a deputy member) together with Sarah Hefferman (youth parliament co-ordinator) gave a presentation on the achievements of the Youth Parliament, the work undertaken and their future aspirations.

In response to a suggestion that the Youth Parliament could work with the Council to increase the number of young people registering and exercising their vote, the councillors were advised that some work had been undertaken with year sevens at Notre Dame and at Devonport High School for boys.

Jake Paggett (representing young people), was congratulated on his work with the Overview and Scrutiny Management Board.

In response to a suggestion that scrutiny could check the process for the election of young people to the Youth Parliament, councillors were advised that the process was being reviewed.

Councillor Mrs Watkins (Cabinet Member for Children and Young People) thanked the representatives for their work and indicated that she had enjoyed a recent visit to them. As part of Local Democracy Week, she referred to everybody's role in democracy, politics and voting and reported that she and colleagues would be visiting and speaking at various schools during the week.

The Lord Mayor expressed her thanks to the representatives for their presentation and also to Ross Johnston (Democratic Support Officer) for his work on organising the events for local democracy week.

48. **TO DEAL WITH ANY BUSINESS FROM THE LAST COUNCIL MEETING, IF ANY**

There was no outstanding business from the last meeting.

RECOMMENDATIONS FROM CABINET, OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY MANAGEMENT BOARD OR OTHER COMMITTEES

49. **City and Council Priorities**

Following consideration of the City and Council Priorities by Cabinet (minute 47 refers), the written report of the Assistant Chief Executive was submitted on a revised proposal. Councillor Mrs Pengelly presented the report to Council and proposed the recommendations set out in the written report. The motion was seconded by Councillor Sam Leaves.

During her summing up, Councillor Mrs Pengelly indicated that, in response to a question by Councillor Wheeler on Barne Barton early years, the Council were committed to the service at Barne Barton and alternative venues had been found. She undertook to provide Councillor Wheeler with the information she had been given.

The priorities would be monitored by scrutiny, through performance indicators, and also by the theme groups within the Local Strategic Partnership.

Following a vote, it was Agreed that –

(1) the City's vision and goals are reaffirmed as follows -

(a) Plymouth's vision is that, by 2020 -

Plymouth will be recognised as one of Europe's finest,
most vibrant waterfront cities where an outstanding quality
of life is enjoyed by everyone.

(b) the City's goals are that Plymouth should be:

A healthy place to live and work;
A wealthy city which creates and shares prosperity;
A safe and strong, clean and green city;
A wise city – a location for learning, achievement and
leisure.

(2) the revised City and Council priorities are adopted as follows -

Our priorities	What the partnership will do	What the Council will do
Delivering Growth	Attract jobs, encourage enterprise, improve skills and make Plymouth a thriving regional centre	Ensure land, property and transport infrastructure is in place to support growth and that jobs and wealth targets are met
Raising Aspiration	Promote Plymouth and encourage people to aim higher and take pride in the city	Promote the positive image of Plymouth through city and regional leadership and support the population in achieving better qualifications and skills
Reducing inequalities	Reduce the inequality gap, between communities, particularly in health	Take targeted actions to reduce inequality gaps, including in housing and education
Value for Communities	Work together to maximise resources to benefit communities and make internal efficiencies	Achieve efficiency through transforming our service delivery and support arrangements, and our approach to customers

50. **Changes in Executive Arrangements**

The Leader submitted the proposals for consultation on changes in Executive arrangements, referred to in Cabinet minute 48 and set out in the written report to Cabinet, for approval.

The motion was seconded by Councillor Fry.

Following an objection by Councillor Mrs Pengelly, to personal remarks during the debate, the Lord Mayor reminded councillors about their behaviour.

Following a vote, it was Agreed to approve –

- (1) the consultation plan as set out in the report;

- (2) the Leader and Cabinet Executive model as the preferred form of executive arrangements, for consultation.

51. **Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry Joint Committee - Governance**

In the absence of Councillor Delbridge (Joint Chair), Councillor Mrs Pengelly submitted for approval, the proposed terms of reference of the Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry Joint Committee, referred to in minute 51 of and the written report to, the Joint Committee.

Following a vote, it was Agreed to adopt the terms of reference for the operation of the Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry Joint Committee as submitted, and to amend the constitution accordingly.

MOTIONS ON NOTICE

52. **Electronic recording of speech and the making of photographic / video images**

In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the following motion (No 7 10/11) was submitted by Councillor Ball and seconded by Councillor James.

ELECTRONIC RECORDING OF SPEECH AND THE MAKING OF PHOTOGRAPHIC / VIDEO IMAGES

Plymouth City Council meetings are formal gatherings of elected Members supported by officers and witnessed by the public in accordance with the laws that govern the local authority democratic process in England. Such meetings should be conducted in a serious and businesslike manner.

The constitution holds that Members will, “be the ultimate policy-makers and carry out a number of strategic and corporate management functions” and one of the ten general principles for those who act on behalf of the public is that, “Members should promote and support these principles by leadership, and by example, and should act in a way that secures or preserves public confidence”. Using mobile devices during any formal meeting is a breach of good manners, discourteous to others in attendance and a hindrance to good decision making?

Current practice is that the electronic recording of speech and the making of photographic/video images (other than by the Council) is prohibited at formal meetings.

I therefore move that this Council:

1. Enforces the ban of the electronic recording of speech and the making of photographic/video images (including by mobile phones) (other than by the Council) and a) places notices to this effect prominently within meeting rooms in the Council House and b) includes this information in all meeting agendas.

2. Requires the Lord Mayor, Leader and Committee Chairs to insist that any device that is capable of transmitting and receiving voice and text messages must be turned off during all Plymouth City Council's formal meetings (Exceptionally, the Lord Mayor or a Committee Chair may allow the recording of speech and photography.)
3. Allows the Lord Mayor, Leader and Committee Chairs to exercise discretion for Members and other attendees who are "on call" for family, health or business reasons and allow their personal mobile phones to be switched to "silent" and placed clearly on display. Any subsequent calls or messages must be made or taken outside the meeting room.

Note: Members who are "on call" should formally request this of the Lord Mayor, Leader or Committee Chairs at the start of a meeting.

4. Instructs the monitoring officer to amend the constitution to give effect to this resolution.

Councillor Ball, whilst moving the motion for approval, sought to make some amendments in order to clarify the proposal. The Assistant Director for Democracy and Governance advised that the action of Councillor Ball was in order.

Following objections, the Lord Mayor adjourned the meeting to take advice.

Following the adjournment, Councillor Ball moved the motion, as submitted (as above) and the motion was seconded by Councillor James.

Councillor Fox submitted an amendment to paragraph 3 to delete the following words

-

'and placed clearly on display' and

'Note: Members who are "on call" should formally request this of the Lord Mayor, Leader or Committee Chairs at the start of a meeting.'

The amendment was seconded by Councillor Reynolds and following a vote the amendment was carried and it was Agreed.

Councillor Evans moved a further amendment as follows -

Delete all from the start of paragraph 2 to 'meeting' at the end of item 3.

Insert

This unnecessary motion is a waste of time and it is not Howes! It is a Ball's.

Renumber item 4 as item 1.

The Lord Mayor adjourned the meeting to take advice on the proposed amendment.

Following the adjournment, the Lord Mayor indicated that the proposed amendment had been ruled out of order as it negated the motion.

It was Agreed, following a request by Councillor Evans, that the ruling would be provided to him in writing.

Councillor Stevens submitted a further amendment as follows -

Delete "Using mobile devices during any formal meeting is a breach of good manners, discourteous to others in attendance and a hindrance to good decision making?"

Replace with "Making telephone calls during any formal meeting is a breach of good manners, discourteous to others in attendance and could be a distraction from the decision making process taking place".

Add to the end to the third paragraph. "This Council recognises that e-communications is a valuable tool in interacting with the public. That it could potentially allow people, unable to attend the Council meeting in person, to listen to the issues discussed in Council, in their own home at a time convenient to them. That the LGA and Local Government Improvement & Development Agency recognise as best practice councils and councillors who use webcasting, social media and the internet to communicate with the public.

That at present no transcript or recording of the council meeting is available to the public unless a specific request is made".

Delete 1 and replace with:

- (1) "Investigates how the use of e-communications can be used to record the council meeting, with the aim of making our decision making processes as transparent as possible in accordance with best practice identified by the LGA and Local Government Improvement & Development Agency. That until such recording are in place members of the council or public can apply to the Lord Mayor for permission to record the proceedings at full council".

Delete the word "off" from 2 and replace with "to silent". Delete words in brackets at the end of point 2.

Add:

5. Requires any attendees at Full Council/Committee/Panel meetings who wish to conduct conversations to do so outside the meeting room.

Delete "Note: Members who are "on call" should formally request this of the Lord Mayor, Leader or Committee Chairs at the start of a meeting." From point 3.

The motion was seconded by Councillor Williams.

During the debate, it was suggested that the order of the agenda should have been revised so that the more important debates were at the top of the agenda.

Councillor Jordan also indicated that a discussion was needed on e communications but in another place.

Councillor Rennie moved and Councillor Wildy seconded that the vote was taken. Following a vote the motion was carried.

Following summing up by Councillor Stevens, the vote was taken on the amendment and the amendment was lost.

The debate continued on the main motion, as amended by Councillor Fox.

Following a vote, the motion, as amended, was carried and it was Agreed that this Council -

1. enforces the ban of the electronic recording of speech and the making of photographic/video images (including by mobile phones) (other than by the Council) and a) places notices to this effect prominently within meeting rooms in the Council House and b) includes this information in all meeting agendas;
2. requires the Lord Mayor, Leader and Committee Chairs to insist that any device that is capable of transmitting and receiving voice and text messages must be turned off during all Plymouth City Council's formal meetings (Exceptionally, the Lord Mayor or a Committee Chair may allow the recording of speech and photography.)
3. allows the Lord Mayor, Leader and Committee Chairs to exercise discretion for Members and other attendees who are "on call" for family, health or business reasons and allow their personal mobile phones to be switched to "silent". Any subsequent calls or messages must be made or taken outside the meeting room;
4. instructs the monitoring officer to amend the constitution to give effect to this resolution.

53. **Devonport Dockyard**

In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the following motion (No 8 10/11) was submitted by Councillor Mrs Pengelly and seconded by Councillor Evans.

This Council resolves:

- (1) To note the work that has already taken place across the city to press the case for Devonport Naval Base and Dockyard and endorses the key points which the Government needs to consider when making a decision, which are:

1 Devonport is the best home for the navy, both operationally and strategically

Devonport provides an operational synergy that clearly surpasses that of any other naval base in the UK. This fact, together with its irreplaceable facilities and skills, strategic location and uncongested approaches, make it the only sensible choice as the main base for the Royal Navy. The MoD should maximise economies of scale by increasing the Naval presence in Plymouth, building upon Devonport's capacity as Europe's largest Naval Base.

It makes sense to base ships and submarines where they can be maintained at Devonport, while basing amphibious vessels here recognises the links with the Royal Marines located in the city.

2 It makes economic sense to have the Naval Base and Dockyard together

Aligning all levels of maintenance (regular and deep) of the surface and submarine fleet in Devonport would maximise efficiency and ensure economies of scale.

3 We've got the skills

The MoD cannot afford to lose the skills at Devonport. It should re-affirm existing surface deep maintenance and submarine maintenance programmes and support for apprenticeship, graduate retention and knowledge transfer programmes.

4 Devonport offers the best value for money

Devonport provides an affordable solution to support the country's naval and defence commitments. As the largest naval base in Western Europe, investment in Devonport as the UK's main naval base offers the effective way of achieving efficiencies in the defence budget without reducing national security. Furthermore, any reduction in size or capability would incur significant costs rather than savings across other government departments facing

increases in benefit claims and the consequences of economic hardship. There would also be very high costs involved in making the land available for other uses.

- 5. Devonport is a world-class naval base and dockyard**
The Government should make a long-term commitment to the Dockyard and Naval Base, maximising use of Devonport's large, flexible facilities and world class skills and underpinning Plymouth's economic resilience.

Further, Devonport's future is entwined with the city's ambitious growth plans and the ambition to create a world beating centre of excellence in the marine and engineering sectors.

- (2) To support and endorse the petition that has been launched on behalf of the Devonport task group by the Trade unions which states:

"We the undersigned call on the Government to:

Protect the massive economic and strategic advantages of Devonport Dockyard and Naval Base over other options and enhance its role and maintain its skilled workforce.

Recognise that any reduction of Devonport would be counter to overwhelming evidence that it offers the best value solution to the MoD and that it would have a devastating impact on the Royal Navy and Plymouth and its surrounding area and incur significant extra cost to other Government departments in the longer term."

- (3) To continue to work closely with MPs, the business community, trade unions and individuals in Plymouth to argue the case for Devonport and to show the Government the compelling evidence that Devonport offers the best value solution for the future needs of the Royal Navy.

The motion was moved by Councillor Mrs Pengelly and seconded by Councillor Evans.

Following a debate, the Leader summed up and thanked everyone who had written a letter to support the campaign; the trades' unions for their work on the petition; the MPs for their work; the gentleman making the t shirts; the school children at St Joseph's primary school and the Herald for running a campaign.

Following a vote, the motion was carried and it was Agreed.

(Councillors Bragg, Dann, Lowry, Nicholson and Smith, having declared interests in the above matter, withdrew from the meeting during consideration of the item – see also minute 41 above).

54. **Local Environment Funds**

In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the following motion (No 9 10/11) was submitted by Councillor Rennie and seconded by Councillor McDonald.

LOCAL ENVIRONMENT FUNDS

We call upon the officers of Plymouth City Council to release the funds available in the Local Environment Fund, and as such allow the good work that has been done by councillors and members of their communities to continue.

These funds to be released to councillors to spend in their wards as already agreed.

Councillor Rennie reported that, as the matter had now been resolved, he would be withdrawing the motion. He addressed councillors on the reasons for submitting the motion, in the first instance.

55. **Cuts to Bus Routes in Plymouth**

In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the following motion (No 10 10/11) was submitted by Councillor Williams and seconded by Councillor Evans.

CUTS TO BUS ROUTES IN PLYMOUTH

This Council notes

1. with dismay the withdrawal of more bus services across the City.
2. that a number of the bus routes, which have been cut, serve employment centres such as Derriford Hospital and Industrial Estates such as Estover.
3. that nearly 1/3 of Plymouth's population do not own a car and therefore the consequences of this and previous rounds of cuts to bus routes are becoming very serious for some of Plymouth's lower-paid citizens.
4. residents of the Honicknowle, Devonport, Efford and other areas are going to be unable to either get to or return from their places of work at Derriford Hospital or the Estover industrial areas and unless action is taken to retain some services. They

have no private means of transport so if certain services are not retained, they will have to give up their employment.

5. where a bus company is unable or unwilling to run a service on a commercial basis, the Council has the power to secure the provision of services by allocating financial support, which in effect makes up the shortfall between the service revenue and the cost of operation. These "socially necessary" services are operated by bus companies under contract to the Council and the Council, not the bus company, determines the type of vehicle to be operated, the route, stopping places, timetable and fares.

The Council resolves to:-

1. investigate further use of its powers to offer support for bus services, prioritising those services which are necessary to enable people to retain their employment.

Councillor Williams moved and Councillor Evans seconded the motion.

Councillor Wiggins indicated that he was willing to accept the motion. He also reminded councillors of the criteria for subsidised services, approved by Cabinet in 2006 and emphasised that the Council would not be able to find significant amounts to fund poorly used services.

Councillors continued to debate the motion.

Councillor Bowyer spoke and then moved that the vote was taken. This was ruled out of order by the Lord Mayor as Councillor Bowyer had spoken in support of the motion before proposing that the vote was taken.

Councillor Fry moved and Councillor Nicholson seconded that the vote is taken.

Following summing up by Councillor Williams, the vote was taken, the motion was carried and it was Agreed.

(Councillors Bowyer, Mrs Bowyer, Martin Leaves, Mike Leaves, Sam Leaves and Vincent having declared interests in the above matter, withdrew from the meeting during consideration of this item – see also minute 41 above.)

56. **CAPITAL REPORTING**

The written report of the Director for Corporate Support was submitted and Councillor Bowyer presented the recommendation in the report for approval, subject to the amendment of paragraph 3.1 of the report (page 48 of the agenda) to change 'hospital school' to Torbridge Campus'. The motion was seconded by Councillor Fry.

Councillor Evans questioned why the figures were detailed as millions rather than hundreds of thousands pounds.

Whilst summing up, Councillor Bowyer indicated that he would be asking the Overview and Scrutiny Management Board to focus on the outcome of the comprehensive spending review.

At the end of the summing up, Councillor Evans raised an objection to a reference made to the opposition, by Councillor Bowyer and sought the withdrawal of the remark.

Following a vote, the motion was carried and the updated Capital Programme was Agreed.

57. **REPORT OF A KEY DECISION TAKEN UNDER SPECIAL URGENCY PROVISIONS**

In accordance with paragraph 17.2 of the Constitution, Councillor Bowyer, on behalf of the Leader, reported on the decision taken by Cabinet on 10 August, concerning the accommodation strategy business case and the reasons for urgency, which had been agreed with the Chair of the Overview and Scrutiny Management Board.

Councillor Ball raised a point of order relating to the use of mobile phones.

Councillor James seconded Councillor Bowyer's proposal to note the report.

The Assistant Director for Democracy and Governance reported that the reason for the urgent key decision was that it had not appeared in the forward plan and that the correct procedure had been followed subsequently.

Following a question by Councillor Evans relating to costs, he was advised to write to the Assistant Director for Democracy and Governance or Councillor Bowyer. Councillor Bowyer indicated that he would be happy to meet with Councillor Evans or respond to an e mail.

Agreed that the report was noted.

QUESTIONS BY COUNCILLORS

58. **General Questions**

In accordance with paragraph 12 of the constitution, the following questions were asked of the Leader, Cabinet Member and Committee Chairs covering aspects of their areas of responsibility -

	From	To	Subject
1	Councillor Vincent	Councillor Wigens	Two week delay in the works at Gdynia Way, works at Beaumont Road, and the potential impact of late night shopping events.

2	Councillor Williams	Councillor Fry	Industrial action at ViSpring and seeking contact with management and trades' unions to mediate
3	Councillor Wildy	Councillor Watkins Mrs	Protection of children's services from the comprehensive spending review
4	Councillor Williams	Councillor Fry	Process for a tenant of Plymouth Community Homes wishing to downsize.
Councillor Fry advised that the tenant should contact Plymouth housing and to let him know if the tenant did not receive proper treatment.			
5	Councillor Evans	Councillor Watkins Mrs	How much money was obtained from school balances last year?
Councillor Mrs Watkins agreed to provide a written response.			
6	Councillor Wildy	Councillor Watkins Mrs	Given the Building Schools for the Future decision, what were the plans for Stoke Damerel Community College and the new school for Devonport and when and how will communities be informed.

Councillor Viney moved and Councillor Fry seconded that the meeting continue to conclusion of business. The motion was Agreed.

	From	To	Subject
7	Councillor Evans	Councillor Pengelly Mrs	Sale of land at Central Park to Plymouth Argyle.
8	Councillor Evans	Councillor Bowyer	Life Centre - completion of a full transport impact assessment for traffic leaving Plymouth argyle
Councillor Bowyer agreed to provide a written response.			

9	Councillor Vincent	Councillor Wigans	salt supplies for this winter.
	Councillor Wigans undertook to draw this to the attention of the Assistant Director for Transport and to respond to Councillor Vincent.		
10	Councillor Evans	Councillor Michael Leaves	Why has the Council stopped deep cleansing of Bretonside and terms and conditions of staff
	Councillor Michael Leaves agreed to provide written responses.		
11	Councillor McDonald	Councillor Michael Leaves	Length of time to collect with contaminated green bins with red tags
	Councillor Michael Leaves agreed to provide written responses.		

59. **Forward Plan**

The Leader introduced the Forward Plan.

Questions were asked of the Leader and Cabinet Members as follows –

	From	To	Subject
1	Councillor Wildy	Councillor Mrs Pengelly	Voluntary additions to the plan that are not key decisions and are decisions taken by the City Council
2	Councillor Rennie	Councillor Michael Leaves	Statement of Licensing Policy – asking whether consideration of the recent appeal would be taken into account.
3	Councillor Evans	Councillor Mrs Pengelly	The number of new items compared with the number of items in the forward plan submitted to the last meeting and seeking inclusion of the work of the Standards Board.
	Councillor Mrs Pengelly agreed to provide a written response.		